

Contents

Abstract	xiii
Preface	xv
Acknowledgement	xxi
1. Introduction	1
I. The Issue	1
II. Approach to the Argument of this Book	9
III. Focus of this Book	10
IV. Scheme of this Book	10

PART ONE

PRELIMINARY

2. The International Human Rights Context	15
I. The Right to Health in International Law	15
A. Wide Recognition	15
1. International Recognition	16
2. National Recognition	18
3. Significance of the Recognition	23
B. Scope and Content of the Right to Health	23
1. Scope	24
2. Elements in Content	25
(a) Curative and Preventive Elements	25
(b) Underlying Preconditions	26
(c) Essential Elements	27
3. Obligations of States	29
(a) Legal Obligations	30
(i) To Respect	30
(ii) To Protect	31
(iii) To Fulfil	32

(b) International Obligations	34	(i) Right to the Benefits of Scientific Progress and Patent	71
(c) Core Obligations	34	(ii) Balance with Other Human Rights	73
4. Summary	35	3. Conflict or Coexistence between Human Rights Norms and TRIPS	75
C. Public Health under the Right to Health	36	I. TRIPS and the Right to Health	75
1. The Right to Health Originates from Public Health	36	A. The History of TRIPS	76
2. The Right to Health Realises Public Health	37	B. Patent Protection in TRIPS and the Right to Health	78
3. The Right to Health Depends on Public Health	40	1. Intellectual Property Protection in TRIPS	78
4. The Right to Health Limits other Rights under Public Health	41	2. Pharmaceutical Patent Protection and the Right to Health	79
II. The Right to Life in International Law – Refusal of Access to Life-Saving Facilities	41	(a) Article 27 (1) – Non-discrimination	79
A. The Right to Life	42	(b) Article 27(2) – The Exclusion and Its Proviso	80
1. Scope of the Right to Life	42	(c) Article 8(1) – The Principles and The “Limitation”	80
2. Content of the Right to Life	44	II. Limitation and Derogation in the Regimes – an Internal Mechanism	81
B. Relationship between the Right to Life and the Right to Health	46	A. Limitation and Derogation in Human Rights	81
C. Summary	50	1. Limitation	82
III. The Right to Property and the Right to Fruits of Creation	50	(a) Clauses	82
A. The Rights	51	(b) Elements	84
1. The Right to Property and Intellectual Property Rights	51	(i) Principle of Legality	84
(a) The Right to Property	51	(ii) General Welfare in Democratic Society	86
(b) Scope	52	(c) Grounds	87
(c) Content	55	(i) Public Order and <i>Ordre Public</i>	87
(i) Peaceful Enjoyment	55	(ii) Morality and Public Morals	88
(ii) Interference with Property	55	(iii) Public Health	88
(iii) Legality of Interference	56	2. Derogation – Public Emergency	90
(d) The Implication	57	3. Application	90
(i) Compulsory Licensing Interference	57	B. Use of Limitation and Derogation Language in TRIPS	92
(ii) Status of the Norm	58	1. Terms used in TRIPS and in WTO Jurisprudence	92
2. The Right to Fruits of Creation and Patent Rights	59	(a) Terms used in TRIPS	92
(a) UDHR and ICESCR	59	(b) WTO Jurisprudence	95
(b) Scope and Content	60	2. Two-tiered Test under GATT Article XX	97
(c) Summary	63	(a) The Test	97
B. Human Rights Approach to Patents	64	(b) TRIPS and the Article XX Two-tiered Test	100
1. History and Justification of Patent Protection	64	C. Relationship of the Concepts in the Two Regimes	101
(a) The Development of Patent Protection	64	III. Human Rights in TRIPS – Is an External Mechanism Needed	101
(b) Justifications	66	A. Integration or Fragmentation	104
2. Connections between Human Rights and Patent	70	B. Resolution of the Conflict	107
(a) Views	70		
(b) Relationships between the Two Regimes	71		

PART TWO

INTERPRETATION OF TRIPS

4. Rules of Interpretation of Public International Law	115	3. 2005 Decision – Proposed Amendment of Article 31 <i>bis</i>	158
I. Application of VCLT by the WTO	115	III. Interpreting Specific Provisions	160
A. Article 31(1) of VCLT and Its Application	116	A. Article 27 – Non-discrimination and Exclusion of Protection	160
1. Ordinary Meaning – Article 31(1)	116	1. Patentability	160
2. Application	118	(a) Three Criteria	161
B. Contextual Material – Article 31(2) of VCLT	120	(b) Interpretation	162
C. Article 31(3) of VCLT and Its Application	121	2. Non-discrimination	163
1. Non-contextual Materials – Article 31(3)	121	(a) Place, Product and Process, and Field of Technology	163
(a) Subsequent Agreement – Article 31(3)(a)	122	(b) Canada – Pharmaceutical Patents	164
(b) Subsequent Practice – Article 31(3)(b)	122	(c) Open-endedness	165
(c) Relevant Rules of International Law – Article 31(3)(c)	125	3. Interpreting Open-ended Language	165
(i) Scope	125	4. Second Use Patent	167
(ii) Parties	127	(a) Ordinary Meaning	167
(iii) Inter-temporality	128	(b) Contextual Interpretation	169
(d) Application Relationship	130	5. Exclusion of Patentability	169
2. Application of Article 31(3)(c) in WTO	130	(a) Ordre Public or Morality	170
D. Supplementary Means – Article 32 and Its Application	132	(i) Contextual Interpretation	170
1. Article 32	132	(ii) Relationship with GATT Article XX(b)	174
2. Application	133	(iii) Summary	176
E. Summary	134	(b) Diagnostic, Therapeutic and Surgical Methods	177
II. Consistent Interpretation of TRIPS and WTO Laws	134	(c) Plants and Animals	177
A. TRIPS and Other Covered Agreements	134	B. Article 28 – Rights Conferred	178
1. Historical Link	135	1. Product and Process Patents	179
2. Textual Link	136	(a) Product Patents	179
B. TRIPS and Incorporated Conventions	138	(b) Process Patents	180
III. Evolutionary Interpretation	139	2. Exhaustion in Article 6	181
5. Examination of TRIPS in Light of the Interpretive Analyses	143	C. Article 6 – Exhaustion of Rights	182
I. Coverage and Flexibilities Offered by TRIPS	143	1. The Article	182
II. Object and Purpose of TRIPS	146	(a) Parallel Import and Exhaustion	182
A. Ordinary Language Used in TRIPS	146	(i) Exhaustion of Rights	182
1. Preamble	147	(ii) Parallel Import	184
2. Articles 7 and 8	150	(b) Open Interpretation	185
3. Summary	154	2. Relationship with GATT and Incorporated Conventions	186
B. Subsequent Agreement and Practice	154	(a) Relationship with Paris Convention	186
1. Doha Declaration	154	(b) Relationship with GATT	187
2. The 2003 Decision	157	(i) Relationship	187
		(ii) Interpretation of Relationship	188

D. Article 31 – Compulsory Licensing	191
1. The Title and Chapeau	193
2. Individual Merits	194
3. Circumstances	194
(a) Prior Negotiation	195
(b) National Emergency and Extreme Urgency	196
(c) Public Non-commercial Use	198
4. Scope and Duration	202
(a) Duration – Temporary	203
(b) Scope – Proportional	204
5. Domestic Supply and the Paragraph 6 Problem	204
(a) The Problem	204
(i) Legal Issues	206
(ii) Economic Scale Concern	207
(iii) Practical Issues	207
(b) Subsequent Agreement	210
(i) Legal Value and Objective of the 2003 Decision and 2005 Decision	211
(ii) Clarification of Practical Issues	214
(c) Subsequent Practice	217
(d) Interpretation	218
(i) Contextual Interpretation	218
(ii) Article 6 in the Interpretation	220
(iii) WTO Covered Agreement	220
6. Adequate Remuneration	221
E. Article 30 – Limited Exceptions	222
1. Relationship with Articles 27.1, 28 and 31	222
2. Article 30 – Exceptions to Rights Conferred	223
(a) Exceptions to be Limited	224
(b) Unreasonable Conflict with Normal Exploitation of Patent	227
(c) Unreasonable Prejudice to Legitimate Interests	227
3. Interpretation	229
(a) Health Related Exceptions	229
(b) Ordinary Meaning	231
(c) Contextual Interpretation	233
(d) Supplementary Means	234
F. Article 73 – Security Exception	235
1. Coverage of the Exception	236
2. Limit of the Exception	237

6. Application of Human Rights Norms	239
I. TRIPS and Human Rights Norms	239
A. TRIPS is Not Self-contained	239
1. WTO is Not a “Closed Legal Circuit”	239
(a) WTO Law is Broader than GATT	240
(b) The Text of WTO DSU	241
(c) Evolutionary Manner of Interpretation of WTO Laws	242
(d) Extraneous Sources in WTO Jurisprudence	244
2. TRIPS should not be Isolated from Human Rights Norms	244
B. TRIPS Invites the Use of Human Rights Norms	245
1. The Aim of TRIPS	245
2. Article 31(3)(c) of VCLT	247
3. The Language Used in TRIPS	248
4. The Regime Shift in Intellectual Property Protection	250
II. Rights to Health, Property and Fruits of Creation in TRIPS	251
A. Application	251
1. Hierarchical Status of Various Human Rights Norms ...	251
(a) Human Rights Sources and UN Human Rights Bodies	251
(b) The Status of the Human Rights Norms	252
(i) Customary International Law	253
(ii) Treaty Law	254
(iii) Soft Law	256
(iv) Vital Interest Protection	260
2. The Impact of Reference to Human Rights	261
(a) Human Rights Limit Patent Protection	262
(b) Human Rights Reinforce Patent Protection	266
(c) Human Rights Realisation through Interpretation of TRIPS	267
B. Applying GATT Interpretation Methods to TRIPS	272
1. Links Between Human Rights and GATT	272
2. Application of GATT Interpretation Method	274
III. The Right to Health in TRIPS	275
A. Object and Purpose	275
B. Specific Provisions	279
1. Article 27	279
2. Article 28	281
3. Article 31	282

(a) Grounds	282
(b) Duration	284
(c) Scope	286
(d) Supply and Parallel Importation	287
(e) Remuneration	288
(f) Summary	289
4. Article 30	290
5. Article 73	291

PART THREE

IMPACTS OF INTERPRETATION

7. Impacts on TRIPS-Plus in FTAs	297
I. Interpretive Relationship Between TRIPS and FTAs	297
A. Relationship in the Interpretation	297
1. Choice of Forum and Interpretation Rules in FTAs	297
2. Impacts on Interpretation	300
B. Relationship with TRIPS	302
II. Heightened Patent Protection in FTAs	304
A. Heightened Patent Protection in FTAs	304
B. Justification for Heightened Patent Protection in FTAs	309
C. Implication of the Justification	311
III. Interpretation and Human Rights	314
A. Flexibility in FTAs	314
B. Interpretation	317
1. Compulsory Licensing	317
2. Side Letters	320
3. Non-derogation Provisions	321
C. Human Rights	323
1. TRIPS Language	323
2. Non-derogation Provisions	323
3. Reference to TRIPS	324
4. Counter-regime of Human Rights	324
IV. Summary	325
8. Conclusion	327
Bibliography	333
Index	353